The Direct Support Workforce: a VERY quick overview

6.7.18
NASDDDS Mid-Year, Columbus OH
Community living and participation
In Minneapolis, a 'house of horrors' hidden in plain sight
Girls endured years of abuse, neglect; system did little

By Chris Serres Star Tribune | March 12, 2018 — 11:15AM

Unshovelled sidewalks in front of the house where Jerry Lee Curry allegedly abused his twin daughters until authorities removed the young women from the home last

Children with disabilities abused at group home, complaints allege

A state-funded group home that is supposed to help South Florida children with disabilities has reeked up a history of complaints including child abuse and neglect, police and state records show.

What Are Group Homes Hiding from Public? In One Case, Maggots.

SUFFERING IN SECRET:
Illinois hides abuse and neglect of adults with disabilities

By Carol Marbin Miller and Monique O. Madan

Aug. 10, 2017 - by David Klepper
From AP
National Quality Forum (NQF) framework

NQF FRAMEWORK FOR HOME & COMMUNITY BASED SERVICES OUTCOME MEASUREMENT

11 Domains
2-7 Subdomains
NQF HCBS Domains and Subdomains

**Human and Legal Rights**
- Freedom from abuse and neglect
- Informed decision-making
- Optimizing preservation of legal & human rights
- Privacy
- Supporting exercise of human & legal rights

**Person-Centered Planning & Coordination**
- Assessment
- Coordination
- Person-centered planning

**Service Delivery and Effectiveness**
- Delivery
- Person's identified goals realized
- Person's needs met

**System Performance & Accountability**
- Data management and use
- Evidence-based practice
- Financing and service delivery structures

**Workforce**
- Adequately compensated with benefits
- Culturally competent
- Demonstrated competencies when appropriate
- Person-centered approach to services
- Safety of and respect for the worker
- Workforce engagement and participation
- Sufficient workforce numbers dispersion and availability
Workforce Key to Quality
Data sources

- NCI staff stability
  - 20 states (and hopefully growing)
  - DSPs in IDD systems
- PHI
  - ACS
  - BLS
  - PCAs, home health, CNAs
  - Includes DSPs
Largest Occupational Groups in the US, 2020

- Direct-care workers: 4,999,100
- Retail salespersons: 4,968,400
- Teachers, K-12th grades: 3,902,000
- Law enforcement & public safety officers: 3,667,000
- Cashiers: 3,612,000
- Fast food & counter workers: 3,553,000
- Registered Nurses: 3,449,300
Number of DSPs in U.S. 2016

- **NURSING HOMES**: 602,630
- **INDEPENDENT PROVIDERS**: 800,000
- **OTHER INDUSTRIES**: 1,572,290
- **HOME CARE**: 1,574,780
- **TOTAL**: 4,549,700
LTSS and U.S. economy 2007-2017

- 1 million+ direct care jobs (54% growth)
- 1 in 6 new jobs in U.S. was in LTSS
- 4/5 new jobs were in home care

Projected growth of workforce 2016-2026 (BLS)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industry</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2026</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Home Care</td>
<td>1,970,900</td>
<td>3,003,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nursing Home</td>
<td>607,900</td>
<td>603,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Industries</td>
<td>1,863,300</td>
<td>2,169,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>4,437,900</td>
<td>5,781,500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Projected Aging of the Direct-Care Workforce, 2010-2020

U.S.

- **Ages 16-34**
  - 2010: 39%
  - 2020: 38%

- **Ages 35-54**
  - 2010: 38%
  - 2020: 36%

- **Ages 55 and older**
  - 2010: 23%
  - 2020: 28%

© 2012, PHI
www.PHInational.org
Age of DSPs in U.S. (2015 ACS)

percent by age

- 16-24: 17%
- 25-34: 21%
- 35-44: 21%
- 45-54: 18%
- 55-64: 7%
- 65+: 16%

DSP citizenship status in U.S. (2015 ACS)

- Not is citizen: 10%
- U.S. citizen: 77%
- U.S. citizen by naturalization: 13%

National employment status (2015 ACS)

Home care
- 68% PT
- 32% FT

Nursing home
- 53% PT
- 47% FT
DSP Staffing Ratio in Ohio

- **HCBS**
  - Total people served: 39,336
  - DSPs on payroll as of 12/31/16: 11,902

- **ICF**
  - Total people served: 10,889
  - DSPs on payroll as of 12/31/16: 11,902

Staffing Ratio:
- HCBS: 0.68
- ICF: 0.91

Source: NCI staff stability 2016
Is there a crisis?

A crisis (from the Greek κρίσις - *krisis*; plural: "crises"; adjectival form: "critical") is any event that is going (or is expected) to lead to an unstable and dangerous situation affecting an individual, group, community, or whole society. Crises are deemed to be negative changes in the security, economic, political, societal, or environmental affairs, especially when they occur abruptly, with little or no warning. More loosely, it is a term meaning "a testing time" or an "emergency event".

**Definition of CRISIS**

1. a : the turning point for better or worse in an acute disease or fever
   b : a paroxysmal attack of pain, distress, or disordered function
   c : an emotionally significant event or radical change of status in a person’s life • a midlife crisis

2. : the decisive moment (as in a literary plot) • The crisis of the play occurs in Act 3.

3. a : an unstable or crucial time or state of affairs in which a decisive change is impending; especially : one with the distinct possibility of a highly undesirable outcome • a financial crisis • the nation’s energy crisis
   b : a situation that has reached a critical phase • the environmental crisis • the unemployment crisis
This is NOT a new issue......for 25+ years......

A Systemic Failure

By Amy Hewitt, Joseph Macbeth, Barbara Merrill, and Barbara Kleist

Direct Support Professionals (DSPs) provide daily support to people with intellectual and/or developmental disabilities (IDD) so they can live and participate in their communities as friends, neighbors, co-workers, students, family members, volunteers, voters, and taxpayers. Increasingly these supports are provided inside the individual or family home, allowing other family members to work and have respite from their daily caregiving.
Root of DSP workforce challenges

- **No** good planning
- Departments of Labor and Education allowed “off the hook”
- Changing demographics
  - Aging of Americans
  - Fewer younger Americans
- **Shifts in laws and expectations**
Other factors influencing reality

• Growth # of People with ID/DD Receive Services
  – 390% increase in last 2 decades
• People with IDD live longer (age 66)
• Growing diversity
• Economic stability and growth
  – Impact of Great Recession on momentum
U.S. unemployment rate over time, 2007–2017
'Help Wanted' signs go unanswered at some small businesses

Competition for talent has grown with the economy, but companies can do more to help themselves.

By JOYCE M. ROSENBERG Associated Press | SEPTEMBER 4, 2016 — 8:28PM
Workforce conditions that deter entry into the profession

- Low wages
- Meager benefits
- Physically challenging work (high rate of injury)
- High accountability for actions
- Isolation from other workers and supervisors
- Lack of a career ladder
- Insufficient training and professional development
SNAPSHOT OF DIRECT SUPPORT WORKFORCE CHALLENGES IN THE UNITED STATES (NCI, 2018)

Of the **224,818** DSPs employed in the 2,364 reporting organizations:

- 34% were part-time
- 66% were full-time

There was variance by state ranging from 23% - 74% of the DSP workforce being part-time.

**46%** state average turnover rate for DSPs

24% Range state average turnover rate for DSPs 69%

Of DSPs who left positions in calendar year 2016:

- 38% left in fewer than 6 months
- 21% left between 6 and 12 months
- 41% left after 12 months

Of DSPs employed within these organizations:

- 19% have been there fewer than 6 months
- 16% between 6 and 12 months
- 65% over 12 months
15% of responding providers offer health insurance to all DSPs

66% of responding providers offer health insurance to only full-time DSPs

17% of responding providers do not offer health insurance

**Average wages**
- **Starting average $10.79**
- **Overall average $11.76**

**Wage ranges**
- $8.79 - $13.87
- $9.47 - $14.27

**Vacancy rates**
- **Part-time 15%**
- **Full-time 10%**
- **Overall 12%**

**Vacancy ranges**
- 5 - 28%
- 4 - 15%
- 5 - 12%

States: AL, AZ, CT, DC, GA, HI, IL, IN, MD, MO, NE, NY, OH, OR, PA, SC, SD, TN, TX, UT, VT
United States: Median Hourly Wages for Direct-Care-Care Workers, 2005 - 2015

Adjusted for Inflation (2015 dollars)

DSP = HHA + PCA + CAN + a whole lot more!!
Three primary advocacy messages past 30 years....

1. DSPs deserve increase wages because they do critical and important work for vulnerable citizens

2. Private sector DSPs deserve increased wages because it is unfair that they make on average $2-3/hr less than DSPs who work in public run facilities

3. Increase provider rates so they can increase wages
Consequences of Crisis

- Individuals with IDD
- Families
- Organizations
- Systems
- Communities
Wasted Resources
NY overtime (past 30 days)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptive Statistics</th>
<th>Total Sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEAN</td>
<td>2,540.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>7,044.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RANGE</td>
<td>0 to 67,170.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Note – average DSP wage 12.74 + OT 6.37 = $19.11 average OT hourly rate $48,559 month in OT expenditures = $582,702 annually per org; across 354 orgs = $206,276,508. Just the half-time extra per hour is $194,234 annually per org; across 354 orgs = $68,758,836. ($1,240 per DSP)
Estimated replacement costs related to turnover – U.S.

- 1,276,000 DSPs (est)
- Estimated costs to replace each DSP $4,073
- 574,200 are replaced each year (45% turnover)
- Costs = $2,338,716,600
  - Roughly $2,000 per DSP ($1 per hour)

Source: PCPID, 2018
MANY solutions to consider
Building & strengthening the DSP workforce

- **Recruitment & selection**
  - Targeted Marketing
  - Realistic Job Previews
  - Structured Interviewing
  - Status and Awareness (PSAs)

- **Retention**
  - DSW Competencies
  - Education and Training
  - Credentialing and Career Paths
  - Recognition
  - Membership and Networking

- **Implementation levels**
  - Organization
  - Systems
  - Societal
Emerging evidence based of interventions that help!

- **Kansans Mobilizing for Change (Larson & Hewitt, 2004)**
  - 12 organizations
  - Training on toolkit with RJP, marketing materials, on-line training, org assessment
  - **15% reduction** in DSP turnover
  - **29% reduction** in FLS turnover
  - Vacancy went from 3.1% in 200 to 2.4% in 2004

- **Removing the Revolving Door (Hewitt, Keiling & Sauer, 2008)**
  - 14 organizations 2004-2008
  - 13 of 15 organizations **1 year of reduced turnover**; 5 had 2 yrs; 4 had 3 years and 2 across all 4 years
  - All experience **FLS turnover reduction**

- **National Technical Assistance and Training Initiative for FLSs (Taylor, Larson, Hewitt, McCulloh, & Sauer, 2007)**
  - 8 providers across 5 states
  - Train the trainer on assessment and mapping to intervention
  - **Reduction in DSP turnover of 40% across orgs and FLS in 4/6**

- **Randomized controlled comprehensive training study (Hewitt, Nord & Bogenschutz, 2015)**
  - 11 organizations
  - Comprehensive hybrid training model linked to desired outcomes
  - **DSP turnover reduced by 16.4%** over 12 month period

**BIGGEST CHALLENGE = SUSTAINING AND SCALING UP**
Systems Level Solutions to Consider

• Getting real about delegated authority and accountability
  – Changing messaging from caregiving to interdisciplinary professional
  – Credentialing with wage incentives through rates or other mechanisms
  – Balance expectations with training requirements (240/40)
• Consistent comprehensive data
  – Incentives
  – Advocacy/legislative proposals
• Maximize self-direction
• Technology-first
• Community interventions for inclusion in generic services
• Workforce pipeline
  – Departments of education and labor
  – Public relations/PSA campaigns
• Technical assistance and training to providers
  Scale up effective models
Workforce development toolkits

• ANCOR
  – http://www.nationaladvocacycampaign.org/welcome
• The Arc of the United States
  – https://www.thearc.org/for-chapters/dsp-toolkit
• Find, Choose and Keep Great DSPs (self-direction)
We must do something radically different

If we want change.....
Questions & For More Information

Amy Hewitt, hewit005@umn.edu
University of Minnesota ICI
Research and Training Center on Community Living
Institute on Community Integration (UCEDD)
University of Minnesota, Twin Cities
214 Pattee Hall, 150 Pillsbury Drive SE
Minneapolis, MN  55455

This research was supported by grant from the National Institute on Disabilities and Rehabilitation Research, U.S. Department of Education #H133G080029 and #H133B080005. Grantees undertaking projects under government sponsorship are encouraged to express freely their findings and conclusions. Points of view or opinions do not, therefore necessarily represent official NIDRR policy.
I am driven to rethink what accessibility means.

I am driven to professionalize the direct support workforce.

I am driven to make home ownership a reality for people with disabilities.